



COVID-19 Economic Recovery Strategy
Consultation Statement
March 2021

1. Introduction

- 1.1 This Consultation Statement has been prepared to provide a summary document of the responses received for the Draft COVID-19 Economic Recovery Strategy Consultation. It details how the City Council has dealt with consultations, how comments (representations) have been sought, and how the representations that have been received have been addressed in the preparation and evolution of the Recovery Strategy.
- 1.2 Our city is facing one of its biggest ever challenges in dealing with the COVID-19 pandemic and knock-on effects on our economy and our communities. The measures that have been needed to try to contain the virus have inevitably had a big impact on our economy, setting back the impressive economic growth of recent years. The crisis has also accelerated trends in the economy, such as the digital revolution and raised many questions about the future of our city. And we still need to address the long-standing challenges of climate change and the deep-seated inequalities in our society - challenges that are now even more obvious. We need to respond to the urgent problems facing the city: managing our transport systems, streets and public spaces to cope with the pandemic; helping businesses to get through the crisis and people to find work and training; supporting families and the vulnerable. But we also need to be thinking about the longer-term issues: how will our economy change and what sort of city do we want to see in the future?
- 1.3 The purpose of the Recovery Plan is to summarise the City Council's contribution to supporting the economy of the city as it recovers from the COVID-19 crisis and adapts to changing conditions, including the challenges of leaving the European Union. It sits alongside the plans set out by the Combined Authority and the Local Enterprise Partnership.
- 1.4 We requested comments on all aspects of the Strategy, however in particular we asked for specific views on the following:
 - Do we have the correct vision?
 - Are the principles correct and do they provide a robust basis for delivering the vision?
 - Have we identified all of the relevant strategic challenges?
 - Have we identified the key opportunities?
 - Have we identified the key projects under each theme?
 - Are there any other projects which should be included?
 - Are there any other funding opportunities which we should identify?

- Are there any further partners that can assist in the delivery of any of these projects?

We also placed the survey on the Be Heard website with an accompanying survey – one which had a slightly different style of questioning in order to encourage completion.

A copy of the survey questions are available at the end of this document under Appendix 3.

2. Consultation Process Overview

2.1 The COVID-19 Economic Recovery Plan has been subject to a public consultation which was undertaken over a 6-week period from 5th October 2020 until Monday 16th November 2020 at 5pm. The City Council communicated the document in a number of ways that was suitable to meet the requirements of audiences given the pandemic.

These methods are summarised in the Table below and were carried out in accordance with an Engagement Strategy which was produced prior to the beginning of the consultation and attached as Appendix 2.

Method	Action Taken
Direct consultation	Emails were sent out to contacts within local communities, businesses and stakeholders informing them of the consultation, how to access it and how to make representations. This included: <ul style="list-style-type: none">- Local Enterprise Partnerships- West Midlands Combined Authority- West Midlands Growth Company- Voluntary, ethnic, religious and disability groups- Business groups- Councillors/ MPs- SMEs- Community Organisations- Housing associations

Method	Action Taken
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Environmental groups - Primary Care Trusts/ Clinical Commissioning Groups <p>We received 12 direct representations to the consultation.</p>
Online	<p>A full copy of the Recovery Plan Consultation Document and method of submitting representations was published on the Birmingham Be Heard website on 5th October 2020 until Monday 16th November 2020.</p> <p>An additional survey was also provided, at https://www.birminghambeheard.org.uk/economy/economic-recovery-strategy-consultation on the same day, in line with the City Council's consultation policies and practice.</p> <p>We received 29 responses in total for this survey.</p>
Meetings	<p>A number of meetings were held with key stakeholders including BIDs, Chamber of Commerce, GBSLEP and the WMCA.</p>

Summary of key issues raised

2.2 The key comments and main issues raised were as follows:

- Comments were mostly supportive of the vision. However, there was some concern about the vision and Plan being based on the City pre-Covid and that it did not reflect the fundamental changes that have since taken place;
- The role of the City centre was discussed in detail. One aspect looked at the long-term vision and support it required to address its changing role post-Covid, whilst another aspect saw this as opportunity to develop local centres and more deprived neighbourhoods;
- The availability and range of business support was a key issue. Some businesses and sectors had not received support/grants, whilst some felt the Council were not proactive or innovative enough in their approach;
- Skills Retraining was deemed as an important tool going forward. Further detail on programmes to support retraining and reskilling post-Covid was requested in light of the impact on different industry;
- The impact on the community was also discussed in detail and the varying impact Covid had on different neighbourhoods and communities. The Plan did not go into any detail on how these issues would be addressed;
- There was a call to lobby government to reform the business rates system to help local businesses and support growth; and
- The Economy Scrutiny Committee felt that the arts and cultural sector was notable for its absence from the report. This was not just the major arts organisations who have suffered, but also the grassroots community arts organisations who might find it more difficult to come back from this setback or qualify for government support. Equally, the hospitality and retail sectors were noted as being hugely disadvantaged and this again not fully reflected in the Plan.

A full overview of responses is available under Appendix 1 of this Statement.

Appendix 1:

Summary of comments and BCC Response to the Draft COVID-19 Economic Recovery Plan Consultation

General Comments

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
Conservative Group	The issue of alignment with the Emergency Transport Plan (ETP) and how that may be affecting businesses was raised.	Address this in the revised version.	Impacts of ETP incorporated into Plan
Conservative Group	It was recommended we that look at Stoke's plans for supporting centres and maintaining footfall levels	<p>Stoke-on-Trent are looking at a number of initiatives including successfully applying for a £2 million Govt fund – match funded from the council and private sector to £4 million – to breathe new life into High Streets.</p> <p>They launched a campaign called 'Powering Up', aiming to galvanise residents, local businesses and partner organisations to support and accelerate the re-opening of the city.</p> <p>Teamed up with Mi Rewards - a loyalty scheme which rewards customers every time they pay on card at participating businesses and was launched in Stoke-on-Trent in December. A number of businesses signed up – including Stoke City FC and Hilton Garden Inn hotel.</p>	Add short paragraph on short term actions in Birmingham to support retail recovery – including the use of government funding on street scene.
Southside BID	We note that this plan has been in draft for some time and we are disappointed that Business Improvement Districts have not, at	Noted. There has been a separate meeting with BIDs and BIDs have each been asked to take forward their own recovery plans which align	Add in more detail on the Emergency transport Plan and

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
	<p>this critical time, been afforded the opportunity to be more involved at the outset.</p> <p>Our experience so far of the recovery efforts by the council have not been as effective as they could have been including difficulties around the grants scheme - it was difficult to navigate and beset with issues.</p> <p>Our experience of getting temporary road closures was also problematic (see below) and we have found the Council's emergency transport plan has not taken into account other roads closed in our district for planned development or events, which has led to a great deal of confusion and disruption to residents and businesses. Our attempt to provide on street dining options using funds designated for this purpose was beset with delays and opposition at every turn.</p>	<p>with the City Council's recovery plan. BIDs are now represented at the Economic Recovery Cell Meeting and have the opportunity to meet with City Council officers on a monthly basis.</p> <p>Comments relating to the Emergency Transport Plan are noted and this will be addressed in the revised document.</p>	<p>potential impact on businesses.</p> <p>Ongoing meetings with BIDs have been taking place</p>
Greater Birmingham Chambers of Commerce	<p>In summary – our recommendations for BCC are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Regular engagement and dialogue with the business community via the GBCC • Lobby Government for greater devolved funding over grants for local businesses • Explore the possibility of working with the business community to review the 	<p>Comments are noted and agreed, however many of these relate to matters which need to be addressed in the implementation of the strategy rather than the strategy itself.</p>	<p>Include details of how we will work with the public and private sectors to coordinate the delivery of infrastructure projects to minimise disruption.</p> <p>Include an outline in the Plan of how BCC will help local businesses</p>

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
	<p>collection and formulation of business rates</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • BCC should work with public and private sector partners to co-ordinate the delivery of infrastructure projects to ensure disruption is kept to a minimum in the city • Lobby HMT to reverse its decision to remove tax free shopping for international tourists • How will BCC will help local businesses secure work related to HS2 and CWG 2022 • Include greater details in the Plan on how BCC will help affected businesses that are impacted by BCC's plans to make the city carbon neutral by 2030 • Support BWCH's plans to redevelop their two sites across the city give the vast socio-economic benefits the project will bring to the city region • Work with academic institutions to use data in a more effective manner to make targeted policy interventions within the sectors that need significant support beyond the pandemic 		<p>secure work related to HS2 and CWG 2022 and a wider blueprint for engaging with the wider business community in relation to procurement</p> <p>Include greater details in the Plan on how BCC will help affected businesses that are impacted by BCC's plans to make the city carbon neutral by 2030 – general point about engaging with Chamber etc.</p> <p>Include reference to the BWCH's plans within the strategy.</p>
Economy & Skills Overview &	That the Economic Recovery Strategy is focused and aligned with the council's Route to Zero climate work, and this is a catalyst to deliver the Recovery Strategy's priorities.	Comments are noted. The Strategy focuses on a green recovery and the strategy does include reference to both the City Centre and the wider	Make clearer the focus on a green recovery and the links to the City

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
Scrutiny Committee	<p>More focus be given to local centres rather than exclusively city centre, with particular regard for areas which have been overlooked and have high levels of deprivation exacerbated by COVID-19.</p> <p>That images used in the plan feature localities outside of the city centre and that the communications philosophy reflects this.</p> <p>Acknowledgement is made of the impact on the arts and culture sector within the Challenges section, alongside other sectors which the Council does not have direct responsibility for.</p>	city however we acknowledge that this could be clearer.	<p>Council's Route to Zero work.</p> <p>Clarify the balance between the city centre and the wider city - draw on the positive implications for deprived areas.</p> <p>Ensure images reflect the whole city and not just the city centre.</p>
CLES – Birmingham Anchor Network	<p>Thorough, comprehensive and, in places, encouraging plan. However, as a whole it does feel like the plan has simply taken everything the Council was doing before lockdown and re-written it for a post Covid Scenario.</p> <p>I would like it to acknowledge just how central the public sector economy is going to be in maintaining the whole Birmingham economy for the first few years coming out of lockdown/post Brexit – and that more can be done/need to be done to maximise this asset.</p>	Comments are noted. Existing projects will play an important role in the recovery. We acknowledge that there could be a greater emphasis on the role of the public sector economy.	<p>Provide more detail around the reset and renewal and highlight what we will do differently.</p> <p>Acknowledge the role of the public sector economy in maintaining the overall Birmingham economy.</p>

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
Be Heard Survey	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Be more prudent with tax payers money and make best value for money decisions; • There is likely to be a shift to home working that will make the city centre vulnerable. • Watch out for people in the smaller pockets of deprivation (within less deprived areas) around the city. • Housing is required urgently – could there be permanent change in the world of work eg more working from home so less need for office space and transport at rush hour (and more need for home with gardens, not apartments) • Explore the opportunities for Housing Associations to engage collaboratively on the provision on affordable housing and the green agenda. • Funding is key. The constant friction between Sutton Coldfield Town Council and BCC - it is unproductive • Council could look at reducing business rates. • Costs /provision to digital equipment and access to education. • Work strategically to support the development and implementation of the North Birmingham Economic Recovery Plan 	<p>General Comments are noted.</p> <p>Whilst we can make assumptions about post-Covid trends, we do not know for certain what the impact will be yet.</p> <p>The Council will be commissioning a Housing and Employment Development Needs Assessment which will identify the need for different types of homes within the City. This will inform a review of the Birmingham Development Plan.</p>	<p>Add in more detail on the Emergency transport Plan and potential impact on businesses.</p>

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ensure the benefits from the CWG2022 are 'localised' and tangible. • Support the development of social enterprise. Assist in creative solutions for locally based employment programmes. • Collaborative leadership at a local level is fundamental to supporting economic growth and competitiveness. • Aston is a civic university committed to the lasting development and success of our city. We play a significant role as an investor and an anchor institution working with the city council and other key public and private stakeholder organisations. • Supporting training/ retraining and employment in Green Industries/ technologies. • Explore further the role of community based third sector organisations in supporting people, families and communities through the challenges of unemployment 		

Question 1 - Do we have the Correct Vision?

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
Colmore Business District	Overall, we are in agreement with the Council's four overarching priorities, and the principles that BCC intends to use to underpin delivery. However, we think that the last few months have shown a need for the Council to be much more bold and innovative in the way it approaches problem solving.	Comments are noted and support is welcomed.	No changes necessary.
Sutton Coldfield Town Centre BID	The Vision seems like it is written pre-COVID and as each week passes, its relevance seems to diminish. The damage that COVID has caused across the Economy is so massive that other objectives fade. Need to have a vision that reflects the cataclysmic affect the virus has had on the city centre and many local centres and especially retail and the hospitality sector.	Comments are noted. The vision sets out what the recovery is aiming to achieve, however, the strategy will be updated to highlight the economic impact that Covid-19 has had and reflect the changes that have occurred since the strategy was originally drafted.	Make clearer in the Strategy the impact of Covid-19 on the economy and the worst hit sectors. Add a section into the document setting out what has changed.
Westside BID	While the overall vision is positive the Westside BID are concerned that there is insufficient focus on the City Centre. In Westside the impacts on hospitality, tourism, culture and arts have been particularly severe, with some businesses sadly unlikely to re-open once lockdowns are complete.	Comments are noted.	Make clearer in the Strategy the impact of Covid-19 on the economy and the worst hit sectors. Strengthen and update the challenges section.
Southside BID	Mistake not to specifically address the city centre in the strategy, particularly with the significant part Smithfield plays in the document	Comments are noted.	Clarify the balance between the city centre and the wider city - draw on the positive

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
	<p>City businesses have higher rents but much less revenue than has been seen this financial year in our smaller town centres. Whilst we appreciate that as a council you cannot do everything for everyone, we believe by targeting support where it's needed most could maximise the return on your investment, both economically, culturally and socially in years to come.</p>		<p>implications for deprived areas.</p>
BCU	<p>Generally, this was felt to represent a good and comprehensive vision with strong aligned priority areas. In particular, the focus on place development and supporting people and business is welcome, and echoes our mission to be the University <i>for</i> Birmingham, and commitment to our role as an anchor institution for the city and region.</p>	<p>Comments are noted and support is welcomed.</p>	<p>No change required.</p>
Birmingham Friends of the Earth	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The vision commits to building a greener Birmingham, including the recognition that working towards net zero carbon can be a catalyst for economic recovery and jobs, which we welcome. Decarbonising the economy is vital for the health and security of Birmingham citizens and must be mainstreamed in all plans and decision-making. However, the vision is not radical enough. We have seen that the city is capable of adapting to change quickly but also the negative impact of a disorderly transition. It has highlighted the many inequalities in our current economic system. • The vision should put people's wellbeing at its centre, using economic growth as a means to 	<p>Comments are noted. The economic recovery will be supported by the Council's Route to Zero work and the preparation and implementation of Our Future City Plan and well as the continued work on the Birmingham Transport Plan. These programmes of work will help to shape the city and deliver concepts including the 20-minute city and enhanced walking and cycling links.</p>	<p>Review the vision to place a greater emphasis on green growth and walking and cycling as a default transport choice.</p>

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
	<p>improve quality of life for people in Birmingham rather than as an end itself.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Aspiration that Birmingham will move towards a network of '20-minute neighbourhoods' with thriving local highstreets, walking and cycling as the default transport choice 		
Hammerson	<p>Hammerson agrees with the overall vision set out. We appreciate the positive approach to recovery and in particular agree with the assertion that Birmingham is well-positioned for recovery. We also fully support the drive towards a green future.</p>	<p>Comments are noted and support is welcomed.</p>	<p>No change required.</p>
Greater Birmingham Chambers of Commerce	<p>GBCC feel the vision would be strengthened by incorporating a blueprint which focusses on enabling a culture of business growth to provide firms in the city with the platform they need to rebuild and prosper once we emerge from the crisis.</p> <p>Calling on BCC to widen the scope of lobbying asks from HMG to support those industries that have been most affected and have received little support (such as the events industry).</p> <p>At a regional level, work with the WMCA and other partners to lobby not only for greater levels of funding from Government but also greater devolution of power to regional and local actors</p>	<p>Comments are noted and support is welcomed.</p>	<p>Review the vision to incorporate a reference to a culture of business growth and embed this throughout the strategy.</p>

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
Be Heard Survey	<p>Creating a more inclusive economy was ranked as the top priority, followed by Strengthening our public services. Individual comments included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I think Local authority governments should be given more funding and powers to access funding from the central government easily to improve their cities; • Impact Birmingham CAZ and Covid19 has had on the Coach Industry • Homelessness • The pandemic provides an opportunity for a radical rethink. • Look for Value for money • Working in partnership and collaborating with local community anchor institutions to achieve the vision. 	<p>Comments are noted.</p> <p>Please note: significant comments around community proposals and impacts have been sent to the team looking at the Community Strategy around Covid-19. Remarks therefore have not been included here.</p>	<p>No changes required to the vision.</p>

Question 2 - Are the principles correct and do they provide a robust basis for delivering the vision?

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
Sutton Coldfield Town Centre BID	Whilst there is nothing actually wrong with any of the principles, the absence of a COVID recovery statement is shocking. The principles are written for a different time and have to change to focus on the new reality.		<p>Add a new section which summarises what's changed through COVID and what's new in our strategy.</p> <p>Add a further principle that makes it clear we will respond to new conditions and issues that have been amplified by COVID and not just seek a return to "old normal".</p>
Westside BID	With HS2 construction now underway there is the potential for considerable relocations away from London. This is an opportunity and competitive advantage for Birmingham that other large regional cities will only enjoy in a much longer timeframe.	This point relates to the opportunities section.	Ensure this point is fully reflected in the Opportunities section.
Southside BID	Whilst we welcome the broad aspects of the plan, we think it may be a mistake not to specifically address the city centre in the strategy, particularly with the significant part Smithfield plays in the document and the specific and devastating impact on the city centre from Covid 19. City businesses have higher rents but much less revenue than has been seen this financial year in our smaller town centres. One could argue that the increased footfall going to local centres has been the saviour of the smaller high streets and that there is		<p>Provide more clarity on work being undertaken around the future of the city centre.</p> <p>Add a principle about focusing on the needs of all areas of the city and recognising their uniqueness – including the critical importance of the city centre.</p>

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
	<p>a good chance recovery could happen there without any more influence than current market forces.</p> <p>Without immediate help to innovate and create new COVID secure spaces, the city centre will be a shadow of its former self in years to come.</p>		
BCU	<p>The Plan could perhaps be strengthened through the inclusion of more explicit detail regarding the nature of proposed partnership arrangements, and commitments to ensuring that it works in practice.</p> <p>There is little reference to the collective role of Universities in supporting the priorities of economic recovery. Universities such as BCU can play a key role in supporting community recovery and resilience. This may be exemplified by large scale skills programmes such as the £3.3m <u>Higher Level Skills Match</u> project which provided local companies with access to graduates, interns and project staff with the skills businesses need to grow and innovate.</p> <p>With specific regard to place development, the Plan talks about meaningful engagement with community groups to understand their short, medium and long-term needs. This collaborative approach to driving community-led solutions is powerful.</p> <p>Lastly, the focus on inclusive growth is also important. However, some of the initial visions as set out in Plans such as the 2017 Birmingham Development Plan should be subject to ongoing critical review to reflect the impact of COVID-19 on demand and requirement</p>		<p>Clarify the governance arrangements for the recovery strategy.</p> <p>The City Council will undertake a review of the BDP before it is 5 years old (January 2022) to establish whether or not an update is required.</p>

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
	<p>for Masterplan growth categories such as office and business.</p> <p>It will be critical to enact a long-term place-development response beyond the city centre which reflects and embraces the strategic change required and disruptive innovation brought about by the pandemic.</p>		
Birmingham Friends of the Earth	<p>The description of Inclusive Growth as “an overriding priority” raises concerns. The overriding priority should be to maximise the wellbeing and quality of life for people in Birmingham, within environmental limits.</p> <p>Maximising opportunities for jobs and skills is a positive principle, however this should not necessarily be delivered through existing and planned projects. For example, remote working and shopping may mean that there is a surplus of office and retail space in the city centre and a reduction in the demand to travel in peak periods</p> <p>The focus should be on the creation of green jobs that will be sustainable in the long term.</p> <p>There is a growing network of small independent businesses, social enterprises and environmentally focused enterprises in Birmingham and nurturing this section of the economy should be central to the economic recovery.</p>	<p>Our policy stance remains that BOTH inclusive growth and zero carbon are important – we will not privilege zero carbon over growth.</p> <p>Similarly, the current policy stance continues to be to work with both large AND small businesses, though focus on the latter and social enterprises, community groups can be enhanced.</p>	<p>Add SMEs and community organisations to stakeholder list and commitment to nurturing social enterprises, independents and environmentally focused businesses. Emphasise importance to a more resilient and balanced economy and to tackling inequalities and promoting inclusive growth.</p>

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
	<p>The principles of economic recovery should include a commitment to decarbonising the economy and enhancing the natural environment in the city.</p> <p>The principles should also include a commitment to Local Wealth Building, utilising the spending power of BCC and other anchor institutions to support local organisations and create social value.</p>		
Hammerson	<p>When it comes to the principles the Council commits to, we believe that they are correct and robust, particularly as a long term investor in the local and regional economy with a major scheme that has recently secured planning consent, which will contribute to goals such as maximising skills and job opportunities.</p>	Support is welcomed.	No action required.
Greater Birmingham Chambers of Commerce	<p>We believe the principles outlined by BCC as part of the Plan are the correct ones to focus on in both the short and long term.</p> <p>We support BCC's plans to reconfigure existing funding packages to help SMEs facing severe hardship and appreciate the need for BCC to align the principles set out in this Plan with the ones outlined in the Emergency Transport Plan (which focussed on 'Four Big Moves') released earlier in the year.</p>		<p>Check alignment with Emergency Transport Plan principles.</p> <p>See engagement and governance point above.</p>

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
	<p>A key principle in the Plan rests upon partnering with bodies such as the WMCA and GBS LEP on initiatives such as the Regional Jobs Taskforce; however it is essential that there is clarity on who is leading what on a regional level, avoiding duplication of work and ensuring the Taskforce has a clear remit and measure of success to ensure it is effective.</p> <p>In order to improve accountability levels around the Plan, we would encourage BCC to engage in regular dialogue with the business community</p> <p>We would like to see BCC working with businesses to overcome practical, day to day challenges (the issues that BIDs faced for example to arrange road closures is relevant example.)</p>		
Economy & Skills Overview & Scrutiny Committee	<p>Use of Route to Zero (Action on Climate Change) as hub not spoke. Members would like to see the centrality of Route to Zero reflected in this strategy, using COVID-19 as catalyst for that transformation into a greener, cleaner city and achieving our zero carbon ambitions.</p> <p>City centre versus local centre focus. One theme which had many aspects to it was the contrast between city centre and local suburbs or local centres. These could be broadly categorised from the</p>	See comments above	Check wording of principles etc. Zero carbon should be one of two hubs and not just a delivery mechanism.

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
	<p>perspectives of someone as a worker, a resident, a consumer or as a business owner.</p> <p>Looking at building use in the city centre, within key projects there was mention of reviewing office space in the city centre but this was countered by reference to building more office space at Snow Hill. Members questioned whether this was prudent with the changing working circumstances under COVID-19. There is clearly still a need for office space whilst recognising the need to review provision as more people have become enabled to work from home as a result of the pandemic. The same train of thought can be applied to those still wishing to live in the city centre, be this for work purposes or student accommodation.</p> <p>There was concern from the Committee that there still appeared to be a stronger focus on the city centre at the expense of local centres and communities across the city. Members requested clarity in the document on what has changed and what we are doing differently to what was already happening.</p> <p>This city centric focus extended to the look and feel of the document, and the images used were exclusively of the city centre.</p> <p>Members also expressed concern about how the city can sustain city centre retail and local shopping centres</p>	<p>The City Council has commissioned detailed research of current Birmingham office market trends around supply, take-up, values and occupier demand analysing actual trends against past forecasts (i.e. pre Covid assumptions vs actual figures). This will include analysis of discussions with key city centre occupiers and their future office requirement and impact on future demand profile for the city centre. Outcomes from the research will be used to inform the Snow Hill business case.</p>	

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
	against online competition, which has been a natural by-product of the lockdown with people turning to online shopping whilst shops were closed. Members noted the trend of people choosing to shop locally rather than come into the city centre since the advent of COVID-19, and the impact of that on city centre business.		
Be Heard Survey	All these ""principles"" are dangerously vague - how can we be expected to meaningfully engage with such wishy-washy statements that will mean whatever the reader wants them to mean... or more important whatever BCC decides they meant after the fact.	The principles are high level.	Review wording of principles.

Question 3 – Have we identified all of the relevant strategic challenges?

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
Colmore Business Distract	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lack of focus on city centre and projects identified are not new. More support required for city centre in recovery phase. BPFs sector not received any financial support especially SMEs in that sector. Need to address both the short term impact on the city centre but also longer term strategic impacts. 	Noted – The city centre is a key driver for the local economy and the emerging Future City Plan will set out in more detail the city's ambitious plans for the city centre.	Content added to the recovery strategy on Our Future City Plan.
Sutton Coldfield Town Centre BID	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Need to address the long term impacts on city centres of Covid increase in home working and how this may effect certain sectors and property market. 	Noted – The city is working with partners to understand the long-term impacts on city centres and how this can be addressed.	As above

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
Westside BID	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Highlights the importance of the areas cultural and hospitality venues to the city's economy and their role in the successful delivery of the CWG. 	Noted - The visitor economy is a key part of the local economy	
BCU`	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> More detail needed on support for new business start-ups and self-employed especially in deprived areas. More detail needed on local wealth building through the Anchor institutions. 	<p>Noted- The Council is committed to supporting entrepreneurship and supporting growth across the city through various local plans and strategies</p> <p>Noted - The Council is working closely with partners on the emerging Anchor Institution work</p>	
Birmingham Friends of the Earth	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The impact of the pandemic on particular jobs and communities has not been considered in detail. The impact on the community and voluntary sector in the city is another strategic challenge which should be considered. Charities and community organisations support a significant number of jobs in the city and play a crucial role in supporting communities and the environment. The impact on public transport is another strategic challenge especially impact on low income workers, younger people, people past the age of retirement and people with disabilities., weakening the economy. 	<p>The City Council is in the process of developing a Covid Community Impact Strategy that will have a greater focus on the issues raised about community impact and the role of voluntary sector.</p> <p>The City Council have released an Emergency Transport Plan that provides detail on measures to support public transport during the pandemic and remains committed to a longer term strategy to support the growth in the public transport network and usage</p>	Detail and links to the Community Strategy to be included

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
Greater Birmingham Chambers of Commerce	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There is relatively little emphasis in the Plan on supporting the events industry which has been decimated by the pandemic and we would recommend the Council to lobby Government for additional funding to provide more help for the live events & exhibitions industry. • More detail on support for retailers especially on High St. • Encourage the Council to work with HMT on exploring the possibility of reforming the outmoded system in a bid to free up cash for businesses which would allow them to start investing in their people and products. 	<p>Noted - The live events industry is included in the wider analysis of the visitor economy.</p> <p>The City Council has been and will continue to lobby government for support for this and other affected sectors.</p> <p>Noted -The City Council remains committed to supporting the recovery of our High Streets. Working closely with BIDS, enhancing connectivity to local centres and the accelerated roll out of the Urban Centres Framework.</p>	
Be Heard Survey	<p>General Comments</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Free online college courses for all adults • Free internet for all city residents • Free training for over 30s • Free travel in and out of city once green air comes in. • Reduce the price of Electric/hydro cars, more hydro cars and filling points. • Every child should have a laptop to work from home 	<p>The strategy sets out the actions the Council will take to support recovery. These suggestions are outside the remit of the strategy and would need to be funded and delivered by other agencies.</p>	

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
	<p>Training & Skills Comments</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Support for skilled job-seekers - when they have skills/once upskilled, residents currently become a low priority for employment support. • Work with both employers and higher/further education to define common priorities for skills. • Free online courses for low income families • Offer training that is linked to job offers at the end of successful completion of course • Easy access to training courses - including - childcare available, grants to fund study, increasing access to ESOL courses yet also running some courses in other languages (e.g. Arabic, Urdu, Bengali etc) • Improve basic skills provision and provide clear pathways from basic skills to higher level skills • Targeted interventions in disadvantaged neighbourhoods • Recognise BCC's role as a facilitator, enabler and commissioner. Hold other larger institutions to account. • Working with the private sector to target the skills that are actually in demand. 	<p>Noted- The Council is committed to helping residents retrain/reskill and is working with strategic partners on a number of projects in this area.</p> <p>The City Council is leading on the establishment of a Jobs Taskforce with other key stakeholders to address the impact of Covid on the local labour market</p> <p>The City Council actively works with key partners including FE/HE providers, developers and employers to promote both the demand for and supply of highly skilled high productivity employment in the city.</p>	<p>Update plan with latest position on the council's role in Taskforce and Jobs Plan</p>

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Create 'Hubs' in Birmingham where local businesses can connect with the local community <p>Digital Infrastructure Comments</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Digital inclusion hugely important. Access to equipment, connectivity and training all need to be available to ensure residents can learn, access training and reskill/upskill. • Make provision of digital infrastructure a criterion for approval of new (re)developments - both commercial and residential. • All Government Services need to be accessible digitally especially in light of Covid. • Make digital infrastructure available to everyone. • Offer better internet facilities across libraries. • Appointing digital champions from a range of communities • Address adequate primary education / secondary education and access to technology. • Providing loans to access equipment. • Use existing community infrastructure to adopt a twin-track approach. 	<p>The Council is committed to supporting partners with improving digital infrastructure in the city including the roll out of G.</p> <p>Digital Birmingham has a vision for the city to become a truly inclusive digital city, it is working with partners including local businesses, entrepreneurs and world leading organisations from the public, private, community and academic sectors.</p> <p>Developing a modern inclusive digital infrastructure is a key element of the council's planning and development framework. However, the council is not directly responsible</p>	<p>More detail Included on digital infrastructure especially link with inclusive growth</p>

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • It's vital that the rollout of 5G and fibre is accelerated to enhance digital connectivity and boost regional productivity <p>Green Economy Comments</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Focus on 'Green Industries/ Technologies', providing information, advice and support, training/ re-training • Retrofitting homes and businesses with insulation, solar panels, heat pumps etc operated directly by the Council, via projects in localised areas. • There is a great opportunity for Birmingham to take the lead in developing and producing new technologies relating to the green agenda. This should include the emerging innovation in sustainable transport solutions that go beyond the bike. • However, we need to ensure that residents in the most excluded neighbourhoods of Birmingham are able to access these opportunities. 	<p>as our digital infrastructure is mainly owned and managed by several private telecom's companies.</p> <p>Noted - The City has ambitious plans for a green recovery and for a net zero carbon future.</p>	

Question 4 – Have we identified the key opportunities?

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
Sutton Coldfield Town Centre BID	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • BPFS clearly very important, but will they need large regional offices and hubs? • The statement on low carbon and environmental does not mention battery technology. Should it? • Smaller firms in Sutton Town Centre missed out on grant support. • Opportunity to look at what a town centre is, who it services and what it should look like. 	<p>Noted – The future role of city centres and BPFS sector is being considered.</p> <p>Noted- We acknowledge there have been some businesses that have not benefitted from grant support.</p>	Provide latest position on grants including ARG
Westside BID	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Agree with key sector opportunities identified. • Many development opportunities to support BPFS sector 	Noted	
Birmingham Friends of the Earth	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There are further opportunities in green infrastructure, decarbonising housing and buildings, the circular economy and nature recovery. • The voluntary and community sector is another area of opportunity. The pandemic has highlighted the potential of community action and the importance of local grassroots organisations that are able to respond quickly to the needs of their local area. 	These specific green industries are cited as the city has an existing cluster related to these sectors. The city is however committed to a much broader green recovery through initiative like the Route to Zero programme.	Reference broader green economy
BCU	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • More focus required on high streets and urban centres. • There is also a lack of focus on business start-ups, and the opportunity to build start-up support infrastructure to underpin early stage survival and growth. 	<p>Noted</p> <p>The city council in partnership with other key agencies remains committed to promoting entrepreneurial activity locally through business support and</p>	

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
		investment programmes as this will be key to the recovery.	
Greater Birmingham Chambers of Commerce	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • More detail on how Birmingham can once again be positioned as a destination of choice for tourists and shoppers alike as we emerge from the lockdown period. • BCC urged to oppose the Government's proposal to abolish tax-free shopping in the UK as it will impact on retail in the city. • Detail on how local businesses can secure work related to HS2 and CWG 2022. GBCC would be happy to partner with the Council to make sure an effective engagement strategy is in place to ensure businesses in the city are primed to secure work related to the programmes. • BCC could leverage their significant annual spend to better support positive local economic and employment outcomes through focused use of social value criteria. In particular, we would like to see BCC work with lead contractors on prioritising local supply chain engagement and further outreach with the local business community. 	<p>The Council is working closely with BIDs and agencies like the WMGC to enable and promote the city as tourism and retail destination.</p> <p>Promoting local procurement and ensuring local businesses fully benefit from major investment schemes is a key commitment.</p> <p>The city council in collaboration with other partners through the Anchor institution Network is looking at how key institutions in the city support the local economy through employment and procurement policies.</p>	
Economy & Skills Overview & Scrutiny Committee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Role of BCC as enabler. BCC (and in working with partners) as an enabler to local businesses. In terms of skills development across the workforce. • BCC as a landlord with regards to buildings use, leases and rates; in terms of disseminating grant funding on behalf of the government or identifying alternative funding sources once ERDF is no longer available. 	<p>Noted- The Council is committed to helping residents retrain/reskill and is working with strategic partners on a number of projects in this area.</p> <p>The City Council is leading on the establishment of a Jobs Taskforce with other key stakeholders to</p>	Update with the latest position on the Taskforce and Emergency Jobs Plan.

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> New ways BC can support existing and new businesses. For example, offering a toolkit of basic business survival and growth skills with a particular emphasis on digital transformation, and working with a variety of partners including the Chamber of Commerce, Business Improvement Districts, WMCA and GBSLEP. 	<p>address the impact of Covid on the local labour market</p> <p>Noted</p>	
<p>CLES – Birmingham Anchor Network</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Would like it to acknowledge just how central the public sector economy is going to be in maintaining the whole Birmingham economy for the first few years coming out of lockdown/post Brexit – and that more can be done/need to be done to maximise this asset. Would like to see more focus on helping the cultural/creative sector get back on its feet. It is going to be absolutely crucial for the re-birth of the city centre. 	<p>Noted – The role of the public sector and public sector leadership and procurement is set out in relation to the Anchor Institutions Network.</p> <p>Noted</p>	<p>Update content on Anchor institutions Network</p>
<p>Be Heard Survey</p>	<p>General Comments</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Only focusing on the short term doesn't allow for real solutions to be put in place. There should be a rolling 5 year plan which horizon scans for potential issues which could affect Birmingham There is a lot of good work proposed/taking place and there are many laudable ambitions - but these could have more impact if they are aligned around a smaller number of shared objectives (the "Big Moves") rather than groups working in isolation. 	<p>Noted - The Recovery Strategy sets out Councils short term response to the pandemic but also its long term strategic aims for more inclusive green economy.</p>	

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Jobs are going we need to upskill our workforce but training is too expensive, what physical jobs will there be soon. This will affect Birmingham residents more than the other issues • Without a skilled workforce employers encouraged to set-up or expand in our area all the other principles will not happen. • Need to focus on how we can deliver a strong future with working from home and with social distancing in place. • Increasing job and training opportunities through developing green industries and technologies will have the most impact for Birmingham resident <p>Inclusive Growth Comments</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The disparity between the richest and poorest in our area is too great. • There's no point in growing if we are leaving the most vulnerable behind. This includes BAME groups within the city. • We are facing a global health and financial crisis. Time for a radical rethink, not for patching up what we had. • What we do must be inclusive and equitable, not aiming for growth but for well being and • Was hoping to see more radical approaches - we cannot have 'business as usual' or the 	<p>Creating a more inclusive economy is a key to our recovery plans. The council and partners are implementing an inclusive growth strategy for East Birmingham.</p> <p>Noted -The Council acknowledges that Brexit will be a key challenge for the city and has been developing a Brexit readiness strategy.</p>	<p>Update the Recovery Strategy in light of the Brexit Trade Deal that was agreed in December.</p>

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
	<p>usual economic orthodoxies that have not shifted the dial on inequalities during normal times, let alone what will be required in response to this pandemic and what may emerge post Brexit.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Birmingham is a city that has multiple, long term and complex issues in many of its communities that has, after years of regeneration programmes and high-value city centre investment has not been remedied. • All of the other principles are appropriate but should be delivered through the lens of inclusive growth. 	<p>The Council is committed to working closely with key stakeholders across the city from the public, private and voluntary and community sector to ensure a strong recovery from the pandemic.</p>	

Question 5 - Have we identified the key projects under each theme?

Response from:	Comments and Main issues raised	Response	Action
Colmore Business BID	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A number of programmes such as the Commercial Development Review, the SME Recovery Fund and the CWG TTI Programme which are 'in development' but do not appear to have had any engagement from BIDs. • As part of a commitment to partnership working, it would be helpful for some of these plans to start being discussed in forums such as the City Centre Strategic Board so that businesses can adequately feed into these schemes, rather than being involved at a much later stage, as has happened with this plan. 	The City Council is committed to ensuring BIDs are fully involved in the City Centre strategy work and is in regular dialogue with Colmore BID to ensure alignment of related policy and research activities. In addition BID's are now represented on the Council's Economic Recovery Cell Group which has responsibility for overseeing delivery of Covid grant programmes as well as strategic decision making around economic recovery.	
Sutton Coldfield Town Centre BID	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • More focus on districts no mention of Sutton Coldfield town centre in the plan. Importance of BIDs not fully recognised. • A major problem that is fast approaching is that six of the city's BIDs are facing renewal in 2021 and there is a clear need for support to give them the best chance of renewal. Loans repayable across the lifetime of the current BID terms are not very useful. • It would have been helpful to set out the ten centres of the Urban Centres Framework. 	The Council is committed to supporting the future development of Sutton Coldfield town centre through the Urban Centres Framework and through the production of a Sutton Coldfield Town Centre Masterplan, which is currently subject to consultation.	The document now includes detail of the urban centres. In addition the Council has lobbied Government for financial support for BID loan repayments.
Westside BID	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • City Centre regeneration/major development tables needs to have the Arena Central development and to Broad Street activity highlighted with timescales and partners shown. 	The Council will continue to work with its public and private sector partners on the expansion and development of Westside. The recovery plan highlights that	

Response from:	Comments and Main issues raised	Response	Action
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Westside BID is supportive of the Future City Plan and would like to be part of the working group that is being set up to undertake a Commercial Development Review. • We are keen to understand how/when Westside might be able to access and benefit from the £23.6 million CWG Trade, Tourism and Investment Programme. • More focus on sustainable housing development in the city centre and by private developers. Post Covid more 'live-work' provision and not just in the suburbs. • We welcome the proposed Regional Cultural Catalyst programme . Is this an opportunity to support Symphony Hall, the Rep and Crescent theatres? • Making the most of our libraries aims to offer family specific ICT based learning support. Can you confirm that this activity will be offered at the Central Library. 	<p>regeneration and transport infrastructure investment in the Westside area has been incredibly important in supporting the expansion of the central business district as well as supporting growth of the residential sector.</p> <p>The Council is committed to ensuring the involvement of BIDs in the development of the city centre vision and strategy.</p> <p>Noted, we will work with the WMGC on stakeholder consultation</p> <p>Noted</p>	
BCU	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Place development: Long -term impact of COVID-19 could be the move toward more hybrid models of working and this should be reflected in the Urban Centre Framework, to reflect and support the possible requirement for smaller suburban work hubs. ▪ Green recovery: The commitment to a low carbon future, route to zero work, implementation of the Clean Air Zone etc. are all positive steps in underpinning a green recovery, but a bigger vision incorporating a regulatory, policy and incentive 	<p>Noted</p> <p>Noted – further details on how the Council intends to deliver its Route to Zero ambitions have now been</p>	

Response from:	Comments and Main issues raised	Response	Action
	<p>approach to accelerate investment into a zero carbon/ clean tech economy would be welcome.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Supporting people and business: This represents a good mix of projects and initiatives. A more explicit focus on support for growth through innovation and social enterprise would be welcome. This would also serve to support the commitment to local wealth building, through support for individuals and communities. ▪ Infrastructure development: BCU supports the ambition for infrastructure development and partnership working to underpin major investments. However, critically reviewing pre-COVID Plans to ensure their ongoing currency in a post-pandemic environment is important. 	<p>reported and approved by Council (January 2021)</p> <p>Noted – the Council welcomes the suggestion and will look to identify what models can be best used to provide support to innovation and social enterprise.</p> <p>Noted</p>	
Birmingham Friends of the Earth	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The ‘green recovery’ should be a thread running through every project rather than confined to one theme. If we are to achieve 1 of national and local decarbonisation targets. 	Noted	
Hammerson	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • PLACE DEVELOPMENT - Hammerson welcomes the Council’s commitment to prioritising development and agrees that it will be an essential part of the city’s recovery over the coming months and years. Hammerson to support this through key projects like Martineau Galleries. • GREEN RECOVERY- Achieving zero carbon is an ambition Hammerson shares with the Coun. We would be keen to engage with BCC on how the work at Tyseley can be linked to MG and Bullring and also on work to develop and electric charging network in the city. 	<p>Noted</p> <p>Noted and the offer of support is welcomed and we will look to engage with Hammerson’s through</p>	

Response from:	Comments and Main issues raised	Response	Action
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SUPPORTING PEOPLE AND BUSINESSES - Hammerson has been committed to supporting local people and businesses through existing developments in the city and will be embedded in the MG project. • Hammerson is working with tenants to support them during the pandemic and seeks support from the council in furthering business rate relief for vacant units and retailers. • UNLOCKING AND ACCELERATING INFRASTRUCTURE DEVELOPMENT - Hammerson supports the Council's ambition in this area and has been delivering improved digital infrastructure across our estate. 	<p>the consultation on Our Future City Plan.</p> <p>Noted</p>	

Response from:	Comments and Main issues raised	Response	Action
Greater Birmingham Chambers of Commerce	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Chamber supports the ambitious job creation schemes in the Plan and the principle of a green recovery. However, more clarity on the direct impact this is likely to have on businesses and the support mechanisms which will be put in place to help affected businesses transition to the new era. The GBCC feel the section on support for young people in the labour market could be strengthened in a couple of ways; firstly, greater detail is needed on how we retain graduates and school leavers in the region in a bid to bolster productive output in the long term. Secondly, we were surprised to see a lack of reference to the Government's Kickstart Programme. 	<p>Link in to ETP / BTP Proposals and explanation as to how business impact will be mitigated (and will be positive in long-term)</p> <p>The regional Jobs and Skills Taskforce will provide a forum for addressing the challenges faced by our graduates and school leavers.</p> <p>The plan will be updated with details of the Council's involvement with the Kickstart Programme.</p>	
Economy & Skills Overview & Scrutiny Committee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Sectors missing from consultation. In addition to the point made on local centres and businesses missing out at the expense of city centre and established sectors, the Committee felt that the arts and cultural sector in the city was notable for its absence from the report. Support for the sector crucial to ensure a vibrant sector to showcase as part of CWG. Impact on grassroots community arts organisations who might find it more difficult to come back from this setback or qualify for government support. In the same way, Members noted the impact on community sports 	<p>Noted – support for arts and culture to be included in the revised draft.</p>	

Response from:	Comments and Main issues raised	Response	Action
	<p>organisations caused by the pandemic, who often rely on the ticket sales of events, and the positive effect on mental health that being part of a community sporting or cultural experience can have.</p>		
National Express	<p><u>Place development/infrastructure</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> National Express West Midlands supports the Birmingham Emergency Transport Plan, lobbying of Government for funding to deliver further public transport improvements and fully supports active travel and look forward to continuing to work with Birmingham City Council to ensure that the city can provide for increased walking and cycling. <p><u>Green recovery</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> National Express is continuing to providing more electric and hydrogen buses and is committed to zero-emission bus fleet by 2030. <p><u>Supporting people and businesses</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> National Express see buses as a key element of inclusive growth and will cut fares, work with employers on discounted fares and support free travel schemes for job seekers. To encourage sustainable travel rather than increasing the number of cars on Birmingham driveways - and pavements - National Express West Midlands would like to see every new home built to come with a travel grant. And a meaningful and enforceable requirement about public transport 	The comments from National Express are welcomed and noted.	

Response from:	Comments and Main issues raised	Response	Action
	<p>provision should be a standard part of planning permission for residential and commercial developments.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Establishing Birmingham as the home of bus electric retrofitting would build on the automotive expertise here, bring jobs and skills to the region and rapidly provide the UK with a zero-emission bus fleet. National Express West Midlands would be very happy to discuss our ideas around this proposal with the council. 		

Question 6 - Are there any other projects which should be included?

Response from:	Comments and Main issues raised	Response	Action
Conservative Group	<p>Questions re support for entrepreneurship</p> <p>Cllr Alden raised the issue of ensuring we support the automotive sector, particularly on transitioning to EV, he was critical of our numbers of charging points,</p>	<p>Entrepreneurial support will be an important strand of the Council's Employment and Skills Strategy, set for adoption later this year.</p> <p>Noted, the recovery plan highlights the step-up in numbers of EV charging points that are being introduced across the city.</p>	
Sutton Coldfield Town Centre BID	<p>Under the Challenges section, it states that 125,000 people work in retail and leisure. These sectors are, or are set to be badly hit with redundancies and empty premises. There needs to be a specific initiative to assist the sector (e.g. to become less dependent upon shop sales and be trading on-line) and to work with property owners about repurposing premises.</p>	Noted	
Westside BID	<p>Handover of Centenary Square operation, management and maintenance to a dedicated new Management Company formed by the Westside/Colmore BIDs and other relevant local partners, following the ending of the Birmingham 2022 Commonwealth Games.</p> <p>Conversion of bus services that serve the City Centre to battery and hydrogen operation as soon as practicable to eliminate air and noise pollution.</p>		

Response from:	Comments and Main issues raised	Response	Action
BCU	<p>We would welcome a more formal commitment to ongoing partnership working with Birmingham's communities and business base to derive additional value from the projects.</p> <p>Secondly, the proposed projects lack a focus on internationalisation and the importance of links with other cities. Internationalisation could have a transformational impact on Birmingham's productivity and prosperity in a post-Brexit and post-COVID environment, supporting recovery through driving growth opportunities for the city's business base. In this regard it would also be important to capitalise on the platform provided by the Commonwealth Games to build Birmingham's resilience and competitiveness, export and inward investment, and to drive levels of innovation.</p>	<p>Noted</p> <p>Noted and agreed – the importance of internationalisation will be pursued through review of the City's Business Investment and Trade Strategy.</p>	
Birmingham Friends of the Earth	<p>The economic recovery plan should take a broader view of the economy and include projects that will improve quality of life for the city's residents.</p> <p>The recovery of nature and the enhancement of biodiversity in the city should be included as a project.</p>	Noted	
Greater Birmingham Chambers of Commerce	<p>Birmingham Women's & Children's Hospital's plans to redevelop their sites is a project which is likely to generate significant employment opportunities in the city and wider socio-economic benefits. The £442m development focusses on two new hospital blocks being built. The investment is expected to unlock</p>	Noted	

Response from:	Comments and Main issues raised	Response	Action
	<p>growth potential in both sites, support developments in digital healthcare whilst also creating a raft of jobs as we look to emerge from the Covid-19 crisis.</p> <p>With environmental sustainability at the heart of the plan, the investment will strategically compliment the other big ticket items in the region such as the arrival of HS2 and the Life Sciences Park in Edgbaston – all of which reflects a number of the key drivers listed in the Economic Recovery Plan proposed by BCC.</p>		

Question 7 - Are there any other funding opportunities which we should identify?

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
Sutton Coldfield Town Centre BID	Town centres need as much chance as possible to benefit from national funding programmes. They need to be ready with properly costed projects backed up by sound data. Funding to allow centres to be “bid ready” is going to be vital going forward.	Agreed	Business Support team to work with businesses to be bid-ready
Westside BID	Low-Traffic Neighbourhood monies available from the Department for Transport. Bids to the proposed ‘Shared Prosperity Fund’ and any further rounds of grant-aid that may be available from the GBSLEP.	Noted	Inform transport colleagues on this point Check LEP update on Fund submissions
BCU	The Economic Recovery Plan could arguably be more explicit with regard to the incentives and drivers for businesses that the Council could provide to support the interventions. For example, rate relief is cited under the City Centre Enterprise Zone – it could be useful to distinguish between the proposed interventions that are dependent upon asks from partners or funding bodies, and those that could be swiftly mobilised following approval of the Plan.	Noted	Will look to see if this distinction could be made more clearly in the edited Plan.
Greater Birmingham Chambers of Commerce	The GBCC believes the correct funding opportunities have been recognised and understandably the effective delivery of the Plan predominantly rests upon securing Government funding for these projects. As such, it is important that BCC lobbies Government to ensure funds are secured as quickly as possible to help those businesses that are in dire need.	Noted and Agreed	BCC continues to work with Core Cities; the LEP and WMCA to lobby Government on business impacts of Covid.

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
Be Heard Survey	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • I think funding should be central to Birmingham to spend on inner city urban areas where there has been a decline over the years. These areas have become deprived. Meanwhile Birmingham City centre has been regenerated and charged for mattress over the past which is unfair on other areas in Birmingham left severely neglected by lack of leadership • Somehow the Government must supply the major portion of what is necessary. Central government departments; • Anything that makes BCC and the surrounding areas less reliant on the car - cycling infrastructure, public transport and walking. • Look at global partners to create local opportunities. • Ensuring Social Value Charter commitments are actually delivered and followed through on • Allowing social businesses access to prudential borrowing, leveraging the Councils asset base and borrowing power. Salix Finance Ltd. provides Government funding to the public sector to improve energy efficiency, reduce carbon emissions and lower energy bills. Salix is a non-departmental public body, owned wholly by Government. Salix is funded by the Department for Business, Energy and Industrial Strategy, the Department for Education. • Green Homes funding for retrofitting Council and housing association properties. 	<p>BCC continues to lobby the Government and access funding where applicable.</p> <p>BCC has commitment to a low carbon future - centred around the route to zero work. The implementation of the Clean Air Zone in the city, introduction of cycling lanes and the Birmingham Transport Plan are all positive steps in achieving our ambition.</p> <p>Noted</p>	<p>Links to be made with town centre regeneration</p> <p>Engagement with Salix and Green Homes is taking place.</p>

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action

Question 8 - Are there any further partners that can assist in the delivery of any of these projects?

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
Colmore Business District	We are pleased to see that partnership working is referenced and, whilst we recognise the importance of our regional partners, it is disappointing that there is not a similar commitment to working with the business sector. There are pre-existing groups and partnerships across the city (including BIDs) that are well placed to co-produce work with BCC and share responsibility for delivery and management. It would be disappointing if the Council did not seize this opportunity to engage more fully with those partnerships, rather than take what is experienced by those partners as an overly paternalistic and often patronising approach.	The City Council recognises the important contribution that BIDs make.	Two BID representatives now attend the weekly Economic Recovery Cell meeting.
Sutton Coldfield Town Centre BID	Yes. BIDs. Also local HE/FE providers	Noted. Two BID representatives now attend the weekly Economic Recovery Cell meeting.	Look at the role of HE/FE providers in the delivery of the Strategy.
Westside BID	Westside BID are keen to work closely with Birmingham City Council on the development of new plans/policies, delivery mechanisms and lobbying for prioritising investment in the City Centre.	Noted. Two BID representatives now attend the weekly Economic Recovery Cell meeting.	Continue working with BIDs
BCU	Universities are working to drive economic recovery, and could play a key partnership in delivering some of the specific initiatives identified in this Plan, particularly against the themes of place development, and supporting people and businesses. BCU is supportive of the Plan and would welcome a discussion with the	Comments are noted and support is welcomed.	Set up a meeting with BCU to discuss further.

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
	Council in terms of the support that could be provided to drive the ambitions.		
Birmingham Friends of the Earth	BCC should seek to work in partnership with the many SMEs, social enterprises and voluntary organisations in the city. These organisations can play a key role in delivering many aspects of the plan and their participation is crucial if Birmingham's economy is to become more inclusive.	Comments are noted and the importance of SMEs is recognised. Engagement with the business community takes place via the LEP and Chamber.	Also pick this up as part of community recovery.
Greater Birmingham Chambers of Commerce	<p>The partners which have been identified within the Plan are the right ones, however, we would urge BCC to align expectations with the organisations they are working closely with to ensure there isn't any duplication of output or inconsistency of messaging. For example, anecdotal evidence received from Chamber members revealed confusion around BCC's plan to reach carbon neutrality by 2030 and the WMCA's plans to reach the same point by 2041 and how the two were interrelated.</p> <p>As a result, we would encourage BCC to work closely with academic institutions such as City-REDI amongst others to ensure they are fully utilising the extensive economic analysis produced by these organisations to inform any targeted sector based interventions.</p> <p>GBCC will be on hand to partner with BCC and key regional partners in a bid to accelerate economic growth across Greater Birmingham and unlock the</p>	<p>Comments are noted. The City Council is working closely with the WMCA and the GBSLEP on carbon reduction and the point around dates will be picked up through that work.</p> <p>Noted</p>	<p>No further action</p> <p>BCC continues to work closely with the GBCC.</p>

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
	underlying the economic potential that lies at the heart of the city.		
Be Heard Survey	<p>A number of stakeholders were listed through the survey, mostly without any specific relationships of how the links could work. These included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The UK government • Housing contractors • More foreign firms are needed. • Any local business that is interested, but particularly the large local employers. • Central government - housing, health, education • Community anchor institutions which are often the mainstay of services and support to local communities. • Existing residents and community associations, and where these do not exist, develop, train and support local communities to develop community organisations to work as partners delivering retrofitting insulation, solar power, heat pumps, local heat networks etc. Also work with local Further Education institutions and Social Housing providers. 	<p>The comments are noted.</p> <p>The City Council is part of the Anchor Network, and also works with FE and Housing Associations within the City.</p>	No action required

Additional Comments

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
<p>Sectors – which sectors and industry can provide opportunity for the City</p>	<p>The Be Heard survey had a number of additional questions and text boxes to allow for further remarks.</p> <p>The following summarises the key points around sectors which should be supported. Some comments were outside of the scope of the document and are not included in the summary.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We need to stop helping the aerospace sector and let it die. Air travel is not needed in the new modern age so we should stop supporting this industry and move people into new industries where their skills can be utilised in other ways. • Create more permanent spaces for outdoor dining, theatre etc • Looking at rates charges for businesses and supporting independent retailers without national funding. Make it easier / cheaper for firms in these industries to reopen & relocate to Birmingham • Encourage innovation to find alternative ways of offering and managing services that are less susceptible to Covid-19 and its restrictions, but are also more sustainable in future - e.g. adapting education to online formats, offering outdoor leisure instead of indoor leisure services 	<p>The Aerospace sector, including Birmingham Airport is important to the City – with key goods and employment supply chains associated with this sector.</p> <p>Brindley Place is a good example of outdoor dining seating. City Centre BIDS have also looking at this.</p> <p>The City Centre EZ zone provides strategic development for businesses.</p> <p>Noted. The City Council is leading on the establishment of a Jobs</p>	

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Offer retraining for those made unemployed in particularly hard hit sectors • Timely advice and support to access grants/loans to assist short term cash flows, supporting financial viability. • Lobby government on their behalf to ensure assistance is made available in a timely manner. • Artists need financial support and an opportunities to create once events will be allowed. Rebuilding of the entertainment sector; bars, restaurants etc. • Encouraging diversification into green industries and technology will be more sustainable in the longer term the approach set out in the plan to offer financial support and reimagining the delivery of some of these industries seems to be appropriate. • Travel alternatives, automation, Transport advances such as electric and driverless cars. • Renewables • Construction, development, refurbishment, repurposing of commercial and residential properties. 	<p>taskforce with other key stakeholders to address the impact on the local labour market</p> <p>Green Recovery/Route to zero work is a key opportunity for the City. Also National Policy – move to hybrid and electric in 2030</p>	<p>Impact on hospitality to be made more clear</p>
<p>Be Heard</p> <p>Any other comments</p>	<p>Covid has shown that a large percentage of people do not need to be in city centres to work so it is time to pivot and have city centres as connection hubs and concentrate on creating communities outside of city centres and improve local centres</p>	<p>The City Council remains committed to supporting our High Streets. Working closely with BIDS, enhancing connectivity to local centres and the accelerated roll out of the Urban Centres Framework.</p>	<p>Do we need to bring this out more in the plan? About working differently / agile working whilst supporting businesses. Also to look at importance of local centres.</p>

Response from:	Comments and Main Issues Raised	Response	Action
	<p>Against a difficult economic backdrop there is an opportunity to think and act more creatively, more courageously and more collaboratively to ensure that local communities and businesses are supported to ameliorate the worst impacts of the pandemic and uncertainty resulting from Brexit AND start to build back better and differently - greener economy, better paid / valued jobs (care workers etc) and where wealth is created and retained locally to invest in local regeneration .</p>		
Locality	<p>Provided a comprehensive response based upon their research and survey and the effect of the pandemic on different areas and communities.</p> <p>Concerns for the future of Birmingham's communities centred around four key themes presented:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •Poverty and economic hardship •Health inequalities •Digital exclusion •Organisational stability and their future role 	<p>The City Council is in the process of developing a Covid Community Impact Strategy that will have a greater focus on the issues raised about community impact and the role of voluntary sector.</p>	<p>The extensive comments from Locality have been sent to officers developing Community Strategy.</p>

Appendix 2: Engagement Strategy for Economic Recovery Strategy (September 2020)

1 – Introduction

The City Council is looking to engage local communities, businesses and stakeholders in the production of the Economic Recovery Strategy. This document sets out the engagement strategy the Council will adopt as part of this consultation process.

The purpose of the Economic Recovery Strategy is to summarise the City Council's contribution to supporting the economy of the city as it recovers from the COVID-19 crisis and adapts to changing conditions. It sits alongside the plans set out by the Combined Authority and the Local Enterprise Partnership. It is a working document and will evolve in the months ahead: the intention is to engage with local stakeholders to refine it further.

2 - Purpose of consultation

The purpose of the consultation is to invite comments on the draft Strategy and to establish a stakeholder framework to guide the subsequent work which will implement the Strategy. To this end, several questions have been included within the consultation to guide the responses:

I. Do we have the correct vision?

II. Are the principles correct and do they provide a robust basis for delivering the vision?

III. Have we identified all the relevant strategic challenges?

IV. Have we identified the key opportunities?

V. Intervention Plan:

- Have we identified the key projects under each theme?
- Are there any other projects which should be included?
- Are there any other funding opportunities which we should identify?
- Are there any further partners that can assist in the delivery of any of these issues?

These questions and subsequent feedback will enable our partners and stakeholders across the city to influence the emerging strategy, avoid duplication of resource and to become engaged with the delivery of the strategy in the future.

Following consultation, the Strategy will be amended taking account of the representations received and in due course it will be brought back to Cabinet to seek approval for its adoption by the City Council.

3 - Who we are consulting

During the production of the Strategy, we have liaised with several internal colleagues and have worked with the Economic Recovery Cell to agree priorities going forward. In this next, formal stage of consultation we will look to engage with a wide range of stakeholders and will include representatives from the following sectors:

- Arts, Culture, Tourism and Heritage organisations
- Birmingham and West Midlands Businesses
- Business Groups
- Equalities
- Health – Clinical Commissioning Groups
- Housing Associations
- LEPs
- Local Councillors and MPs
- Religious and Faith-based
- Universities and Further Education Colleges
- Voluntary organisations

4 – Process

The consultees shall be contacted via email rather than postal addressees given the current pandemic and the greater bias towards working from home rather than offices. The consultation will also be made available on Be Heard.

Birmingham City Council is began statutory formal consultation on 5th October 2020 and the consultation ran for 6 weeks.

Due to Covid-19 regulations the majority of this consultation was conducted via email and without stakeholder events, however we held meetings with key stakeholders and partners such as the Greater Birmingham and Solihull Local Enterprise Partnership (GBSLEP), the West Midlands Combined Authority (WMCA), the Birmingham Chamber of Commerce and the universities using virtual platforms.

5 - Next steps

The table below outlines the projected timetable of events:

<u>Date</u>	<u>Engagement</u>	<u>Who was involved</u>
July – August 2020	Sharing of initial report and priorities	Recovery Cell and EMT
September 2020	Sign-off Strategy for Consultation	EMT
5th October – 16 th November 2020	Six-week Consultation Period	Stakeholders and Partners as described in section 3
October – November 2020	Meetings with key stakeholders as part of the consultation process	GBSLEP, WMCA, the Chamber and universities
December 2020	Meetings to discuss comments	Internal working group and the Recovery Cell
March 2021	Report to Cabinet	Cabinet

APPENDIX 3 – Be Heard Survey Questions

Question 1: What is your name?

Question 2: What is your email address?

Question 3: Are you responding as an individual, or on behalf of a business / organisation

Question 4: Please enter the type of business you are engaged in

Question 5: Please enter the geographical location of your business

Question 6: The City Council has identified four key priorities for recovering from Covid-19; how would you rate them in order of importance?

- Is there anything you feel that we have not considered? (please explain)

Question 7: What do you think needs to be done to address these two challenges? (please explain)

Question 8: If relevant, how does this relate to your business or sector? (please explain)

Question 9: We have identified key principles in our approach to recovery. Which principle do you feel is the most important?

- Please can you explain why you chose this principle

Question 10: There are some key sectors that have been particularly hard hit by the lockdown and any subsequent restrictions that are likely to remain in place. Please rate in order the industries you feel have suffered the greatest. (Retail and leisure; Tourism and hospitality; Automotive; Education; Aviation and aerospace)

- Are there any other sectors you feel have been particularly hard hit?
- Please explain what you think we can do to support these industries?

Question 11: The city does also have some key sectors that are more resilient to the impacts of the outbreak and present good opportunities for growth during the recovery which can create high quality jobs. (Business Professional and Financial Services (BPFS); Digital and creative industries; Healthcare and life sciences; Low carbon and environmental).

- Are there any other sectors which you think provide good opportunities for growth during the recovery?

Question 12: Considering the 'Place development' theme (see pages 20-28 of the Covid-19 Economic Recovery Plan document). How far do you agree with this statement? The following projects will support the 'Place Development' theme.

- Regeneration - City Centre major developments
- Supporting the future of the city centre
- Regeneration - major employment sites
- Maximising the legacy and benefits of the Commonwealth Games
- Supporting our high streets and urban centres
- Affordable housing
- Anchor Institutions and Community Wealth Building

Question 13: Considering the 'Green Recovery' theme (see pages 29-32 of the Covid-19 Economic Recovery Plan document). How far do you agree with this statement? The following areas of activity will support the 'Green Recovery' theme.

- Birmingham - Route to Zero
- East Birmingham - Route to Zero
- Housing - a catalyst for green and sustainable development

Question 14: Considering the 'Supporting People and Business' theme (see pages 33-38 of the Covid-19 Economic Recovery Plan document). How far do you agree with this statement? The following areas of activity will support the 'Supporting People and Business' theme.

- Supporting business
- Maximising job opportunities from regeneration and infrastructure projects for local people
- Supporting our cultural sector
- Working with regional partners to maximise funding for city's workers
- Supporting our young people into work
- Supporting people into work

Question 15: Considering the 'Unlocking and accelerating infrastructure development' theme (see page 39 of the Covid-19 Economic Recovery Plan document). How far do you agree with this statement? The following areas of activity will support the 'Unlocking and accelerating infrastructure development' theme.

- Transport and Highways: delivery of major priority projects
- East Birmingham public transport improvements
- Delivering Digital Inclusion

Question 16: Are there any opportunities for funding that you would advise the council to explore?

Question 17: Are there any key partners you would recommend the council could work with to deliver this programme of work?

Question 18: What do you feel are the key challenges for your sector/area of the city or your business? What should the city council do to help address these?

Question 19: Do you have any further comments you would wish to make?

Question 20: Age: Which age group applies to you?

Question 21: Sex/Gender: What is your sex?

Question 22: Disability: Do you have any physical or mental health conditions or illnesses lasting or expected to last for 12 months or more?

Question 23: Ethnicity: What is your ethnic group?

Question 24: Sexual Orientation: What is your Sexual Orientation?

Question 25: Religion: What is your religion or belief?